Ms. Helen Clark  
Administrator  
United Nations Development Programme  
One United Nations Plaza  
New York, NY 10017  
USA  

15 November 2012  

Re: Recent UN reports on HIV prevention efforts, the commercial sex industry and sex trafficking

Dear Administrator Clark:

We write from organizations in many different countries working to end sex trafficking and the exploitation of women and girls in prostitution to express great concern about two recent reports on efforts to prevent HIV within the commercial sex industry: the Global Commission on HIV and the Law report *HIV and the Law: Risks, Rights and Health* (“Global Commission Report”) released on 9 July 2012, and the UNDP, UNFPA and UNAIDS report *Sex Work and the Law in Asia and the Pacific* (“Asia Pacific Report”) released on 18 October 2012. Many of our organizations are led by trafficking survivors and know first-hand the human rights violations inherent in sex trafficking and exploitation; others have spent years working internationally against the sexual exploitation of women and bring substantial expertise and experience to this field.

We applaud the United Nations ongoing commitment to end the global AIDS epidemic and welcome the clear call to end the discrimination, stigma and police harassment faced by people living with HIV. We support the Global Commission Report’s focus on the role that violence against women and gender discrimination play in making women and girls particularly vulnerable to HIV, and its call to link effective HIV prevention to gender equality efforts (and note the disturbing absence of a gender perspective in the Asia Pacific Report). However, we are deeply concerned with both reports’ incomplete and misleading information regarding the effects of decriminalizing prostitution and surrounding activities, including brothel-keeping and pimping, and its effect on anti-trafficking efforts as well as women’s rights.

We recognize that you have been a passionate participant in the prostitution debate and, as Prime Minister of New Zealand at the time, strongly supported decriminalization. Notwithstanding, we are hopeful that you will consider the concerns raised by the many organizations we represent.

*Effect on efforts to prevent and combat sex trafficking*

The broad legislative reforms called for in both reports with respect to prostitution, including decriminalizing the entire prostitution industry and significantly narrowing the definition of sex trafficking, run counter to international consensus regarding effective ways to address and prevent sex trafficking. The 2000 UN Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children, contains the first internationally agreed upon definition of trafficking; crucially, this definition reflects the wide variety of sex trafficking survivors’ experiences. Anti-trafficking activists have advocated for countries to adopt this definition for the last 12 years in order to ensure that traffickers are brought to justice and survivors receive necessary
services. Yet the reports recommend that this definition be revised and narrowed. In conjunction with limiting this definition, the reports call for the decriminalization of exploitive conduct that would clearly be covered by the Protocol’s definition, including pimping and profiting off of another’s prostitution.

In addition, the reports call for the repeal of all laws prohibiting the purchase of sex, even though the UN Trafficking Protocol\(^1\), the UN Committee on the Elimination of all Forms of Discrimination against Women\(^2\), and the head of UN Women\(^3\) have all called for countries to combat the demand for sex in order to prevent sex trafficking. Not only are the reports’ recommendations in direct opposition to efforts and policies that have been and are widely supported throughout the UN, but they may also jeopardize efforts to prevent sex trafficking, which cannot be a side effect of efforts to prevent HIV.

The reports draw a distinct line between “voluntary adult sex work” and “exploitative, coerced, often violent trafficking of people”. Through our experiences working with survivors of trafficking, we have learned that in practice it is often difficult to draw this distinct line, as a large proportion of people in prostitution were coerced or entered the sex industry as minors, and many traffickers, pimps and exploiters can exercise subtle, psychological control – rather than overt violence - over their victims. Changing laws even for “voluntary adult sex work” impacts the entire spectrum of the sex industry, including sex trafficking. In the Netherlands\(^5\) and New Zealand\(^6\), where prostitution is legal, minors and adults continue to be exploited in the legal prostitution industry.

**Women’s ability to negotiate condom use**

In order to stop the spread of HIV, women must be able to negotiate condom use. Both reports state that laws regulating the sex industry make it harder to negotiate safe conditions and consistent condom use and imply that legalization or decriminalization of prostitution will enable women to more effectively insist on the use of condoms. This argument is deeply flawed. The Global Commission Report recognizes that many women are in prostitution “in order to support a family, an education or maybe a drug habit,” underlining the dependency these women have on money they receive from sex buyers. Women in prostitution often do not have the ability to require the men who buy sex from them to use a condom, nor do they have the ability to turn away the additional money often offered by men for sex without a condom. For example, Senegal legalized prostitution in 1969, and yet the president of a non-profit that works with HIV positive women notes the role of economic desperation on condom use, “Sex workers have told us that when they ask a client to use a condom, he offers to double the price to have sex without the condom. These women are trying to provide for their children and families, so they take the offer.” Women in prostitution may also face additional violence if they insist on condom use. In addition, in countries where prostitution is legal, many in prostitution do not register with authorities and many remain in the illegal sector and thus are outside the reach of HIV prevention campaigns, outreach and services.

**Incomplete information regarding effects of decriminalization of prostitution**

While both reports champion New Zealand’s law decriminalizing prostitution as a best practice to protect people in prostitution, reduce violence and prevent HIV, the New Zealand government’s official report (published during your term as Prime Minister) on the effects of the law tells a different story. According to the government report, “the majority of sex workers interviewed felt that the [act decriminalizing prostitution] could do little about violence that occurred\(^11\) in the sex industry and were not more likely to report acts of violence to the police\(^12\). In addition, most people
in prostitution “felt there had been no great change”\textsuperscript{13} in their access to health services and information, and key informants “were not aware of any substantial change in the use of safer sex practices by sex workers”\textsuperscript{14}.

Conversely, the reports dismiss and mischaracterize the effects of Sweden’s law, which decriminalizes prostitution for those selling sex, but criminalizes the purchase of sexual services as well as third party activities surrounding prostitution. This approach is consistent with targeting the demand that fuels sex trafficking. Contrary to the reports’ accounts that ‘end demand’ approaches are ineffective, in a 2010 government report analyzing the effects of the law, street prostitution has halved (while increasing dramatically in Sweden’s neighbors\textsuperscript{15}), the number of foreign women in street prostitution hasn’t dramatically increased (as has happened in Sweden’s neighbors), and Sweden has become an undesirable destination for human traffickers since the passage of the law.\textsuperscript{16}

While there is disagreement within the human rights community as to the best approach to combat sex trafficking as well as prevent the spread of HIV, the reports present a biased and misleading snapshot of the effects of various approaches. If the drafters of the reports – in particular the Asia Pacific Report - had consulted with a broader range of stakeholders, including anti-trafficking and women’s rights organizations as well as trafficking survivors, the reports could have presented a HIV prevention approach that did not call for rolling back the progress made by the anti-trafficking and women’s rights movements. The legislative recommendations steer countries towards an approach that has neither improved the health or safety of those in prostitution, nor reduced exploitation and trafficking in the sex industry.

To be truly effective, efforts to prevent HIV and sex trafficking must be pursued simultaneously through a holistic approach. For vulnerable and marginalized populations, including people in prostitution, the focus must address comprehensive health and safety needs. This includes HIV prevention, but must also include responding to the physical, emotional and sexual violence often experienced by those in prostitution. Efforts and resources must also focus on providing exit options for people who wish to exit prostitution, particularly because many women in prostitution are not able to negotiate condom use. The most effective way to empower persons in prostitution to better protect themselves against HIV is to increase their ability to get out of a situation in which they are at increased risk of it. Indeed, we must work to promote gender equality in all aspects of society so that fewer women and girls are put in this vulnerable position in the first place. We respectfully request that you re-examine the findings and recommendations included in these two reports, and that you consult with organizations that work closely with trafficking survivors – including those that have signed on to this letter – to discuss your findings. We ask you to publicize these concerns by posting this letter on the Global Commission on HIV and the Law, UNDP, UNFPA and UNAIDS websites.

Thank you for your attention and we look forward to hearing from you. Please reach out Lauren Hersh at Equality Now at +1 (212) 586-0906 or at lhersh@equalitynow.org.

Sincerely,

Josua Mata  
Secretary-General  
Alliance of Progressive Labor  
Philippines

Hélène de Rugy  
Déléguée générale  
Amicale du Nid  
France

Ruchira Gupta  
Executive Director  
Apne Aap  
India

3
Marcello D’Amico
President
Aretusa Association
Europe

Suzanne Jay
Asian Women Coalition
Ending Prostitution
Canada

Esohe Aghatise
Founder and Executive Director
Associazione Iroko Onlus
Italy

Sr Lucy van Kessel pbvm
Coordinator
Australian Catholic Religious Against Trafficking in Humans – Western Australia
Australia

Liza Gonzales
Bagong Kamalayan Collective, Inc.
Philippines

Catherine Joyce
Advocacy Manager
Barnardos Ireland
Ireland

Soka Handinah
Chairperson
Board of LBH APIK
Semarang
Indonesia

Vednita Carter
Founder/Executive Director
Breaking Free
United States

Alma Bulawan
President
Buklod Centre
Philippines

Betty Mabitad
1st Vice President
Business & Professional Women - Ormoc
Philippines

Lee Lakeman
Spokesperson
Canadian Association of Sexual Assault Centres
Canada

Sandra Hunnicutt
Executive Director
Captive Daughters
United States

Norma Ramos
Executive Director
Coalition Against Trafficking in Women (CATW)
International

Jean Enriquez
Executive Director
CATW Asia Pacific
Philippines

Sheila Jeffreys
Director
CATW Australia
Australia

Rachel Durchslag
Executive Director
Chicago Alliance Against Sexual Exploitation
United States

Zenaida S. Mique
Executive Director
Claimants 1081
Philippines

Pat Gartlan
Spokesperson
Coalition Against Legalised Brothels
Australia

Josefa Pizon
Chairperson
Coalition of Ormoc Women (COW)
Philippines

Melinda Tankard Reist
Co-Founder
Collective Shout
Australia

Marianne Bruun
Chair
Committee on Gender Equality of the Social Democratic Party in Denmark
Denmark

Germaine Price
Main Representative
Company of the Daughters of Charity of St. Vincent de Paul
International

Winifred Doherty
Main NGO Representative to the UN
Congregation of Our Lady of Charity of the Good Shepherd
International

Tina Frundt
Executive Director/Founder
Courtney’s House
United States

Carmelita Nuqui
Executive Director
DAWN
Philippines
Lina Nealon  
Director  
**Demand Abolition**  
United States

Celia Flor  
Executive Director  
**Development Through Active Women Networking Foundation, Inc.**  
Philippines

Karen McHugh  
CEO  
**Doras Luimni**  
Ireland

Nozizwe Madlala-Routledge  
Founder and Director  
**Embrace Dignity**  
South Africa

Yasmeen Hassan  
Global Director  
**Equality Now**  
International

Cécile Gréboval  
Secretary General  
**European Women’s Lobby**  
International

Trisha Baptie  
**EVE (formerly Exploited Voices now Educating)**  
Canada

Marlene Rellon Alastra  
Founder/Program Manager  
**FOCUS, Inc.**  
Philippines

Gro Lindstad  
Executive Director  
**FOKUS Forum for Women and Development**  
Norway

Laura J. Lederer  
President  
**Global Centurion Foundation**  
United States

Malika Saada Saar  
Executive Director  
**Human Rights Project for Girls**  
United States

Ambassador Swanee Hunt  
Chair  
**Hunt Alternatives Fund**  
United States

Denise Charlton  
Chief Executive  
**Immigrant Council of Ireland**  
Ireland

Susana Chiarotti  
Founder/Director  
**Institute of Gender, Law and Development in Argentina (INSGENAR)**  
Argentina

Fatima Rodrigo  
NGO Representative at the UN  
**International Presentation Association of the Sisters of the Presentation**  
International

Dalia Puidokiene  
Director  
**Klaipeda Social and Psychological Services Center**  
Lithuania

Ana Luisa Calix  
President  
**Lawig Bubai**  
Philippines

Hanne Helth  
Spokesperson  
**March 8 Initiative**  
Denmark

Bro. Steven O'Neil, SM  
Main Representative  
** Marianists International**  
International

Natalija Kurcinskaja  
Director  
**Missing Persons' Families Support Centre**  
Lithuania

Caroline Themm  
Vice President  
**National Council of Women of the US**  
United States

Niahm Wilson  
Manager  
**National Domestic Violence Advocacy Services (NDVAS) Sligo**  
Ireland

Jacqueline Healy  
Women's Health & Human Rights Worker  
**National Women’s Council of Ireland**  
Ireland

Sonia Ossorio  
President  
**NOW-NYC**  
United States

Kathy Xian  
Executive Director  
**Pacific Alliance to Stop Slavery**  
United States
Emil Justimbaste
Chief Executive Trustee
Pagtinabangay Foundation, Inc
Philippines

Kathleen Barry, Ph.D.
Professor Emerita of Penn State University*, Founder and former Executive Director of CATW
United States

Maria Concepcion De Los Santos
President
PKKK - National Rural Women Coalition
Philippines

Kelly Hinton
Executive Director
Project Respect
Australia

Dr Paulo O.J. Fuller
Director
RENEW Foundation
Philippines

Jimmy Lee
Executive Director
Restore NYC
United States

Mildrid Mikkelsen
Project Manager
ROSA
Norway

Sarah Benson
CEO
Ruhama
Ireland

Kathy Xian
Executive Director
Safe Zone Foundation/Girl Fest Hawaii
United States

Jonathan M. Nambu
Executive Director
Samaritana Transformation Ministries, Inc.
Philippines

Indrani Sinha
Director
Sanlaap
India

Myrna Jimenez
Chairperson
SARILAYA
Philippines

Linda Smith (U.S. Congress 1995-99)
Founder and President
Shared Hope International International

Celine Paramunda
UN Representative
Society of Catholic Medical Missionaries International

Fumi Suzuki
Director
Space Allies
Japan

Kimberly Singer Babiarz, Ph.D.
Health Economics Researcher
Stanford University*
United States

Guðrún Jónsdóttir
Spokesperson
Stigamot
Iceland

Denise Ritchie
Founder/Barrister
Stop Demand Foundation
New Zealand

Mary Crilly
Director
Stop Sex Trafficking Cork
Ireland

Shu-Hua Kang
Executive Director
Taipei Women's Rescue Foundation
Taiwan

Jeanette Laurel - Ampog
Executive Director
Talikala
Philippines

Mary Kay Louchart
Chief Administrative Officer
The Grail
United States

Iluta Lace
Manager of the Association
The Resource Center for Women "Marta"
Latvia

Michele Morek
Director
UNANIMA International International

Sally Kader
President
United States Federation for Middle East Peace
United States
Lee Lakeman  
Member of the Collective  
Vancouver Rape Relief and Women's Shelter  
Canada

Ana Maria R. Nemenzo  
National Coordinator  
WomanHealth Philippines  
Philippines

Jean Justimbaste  
Coordinator  
WomanHealth Philippines – Leyte  
Philippines

Prof. Aurora De Dios  
Executive Director  
Women and Gender Institute (WAGI), Miriam College  
Philippines

Ms. Randi Iversen  
President  
Women’s Council in Denmark  
Denmark

Jelen Paclarin  
Executive Director  
Women's Legal and Human Rights Bureau (WLB)  
Philippines

Ray Justin Ventura  
President  
Youth and Students Advancing Gender Equality  
Philippines

Susana Pavlou  
President  
Cyprus Women’s Lobby  
Director  
Mediterranean Institute of Gender Studies  
Cyprus

Györgyi Tóth  
President  
Hungarian Women’s Lobby  
Hungary

Anti-Pornography and Prostitution Research Group  
Sweden

Janet Hope  
Advocacy Chair  
Zonta International District 16  
New Zealand

Samantha Berg  
National Coordinator  
Stop Porn Culture  
Founder/Director  
Genderberg.com  
United States

Samantha Berg  
National Coordinator  
Stop Porn Culture  
Founder/Director  
Genderberg.com  
United States

Silvia Murray Wakefield  
Acting Deputy Chief Executive Officer  
Object  
United Kingdom

Monika Hartenfels  
Executive Director  
Solwodi  
Germany

Monika Hartenfels  
Executive Director  
Solwodi  
Germany

Denise Marshall  
Chief Executive  
Eaves  
United Kingdom

*affiliation for identification purposes only

See e.g., CEDAW Committee, Concluding Observations: Republic of Korea, para. 23(f), U.N. Doc. CEDAW/C/KOR/CO/7 (2011) (calling on the Republic of Korea to “[t]ake appropriate measures to suppress the exploitation of prostitution of women, including by discouraging the demand for prostitution”); CEDAW Committee, Concluding Observations: Botswana, para. 28, U.N. Doc. CEDAW/C/BOT/CO/3 (2010) (calling on Botswana to “take appropriate measures to suppress the exploitation of prostitution of women, including through the discouragement of the demand for prostitution”); CEDAW Committee, Concluding Observations: Denmark, para. 35, U.N. Doc. CEDAW/C/DEN/CO/7 (2009) (calling on Denmark to “strengthen measures aimed at addressing the exploitation of prostitution in the country and, in particular, the demand for prostitution”).


Daalders, A.L., Prostitution in the Netherlands since the lifting of the brothel ban, WODC (Research and Documentation Centre, Dutch Ministry of Security and Justice) (2007).


See e.g. German Federal Ministry for Family Affairs, Senior Citizens, Women and Youth, Report by the Federal Government on the Impact of the Act Regulating the Legal Situation of Prostitutes (Prostitution Act), July 2007, pg. 16 –29; Andreas Shloenhardt & Human Trafficking Working Group, Happy Birthday, Brothels! Ten Years of Prostitution Regulation in Queensland, The University of Queensland, TC Beirne School of Law. 21 September 2009 (which estimated that 90% of the commercial sex industry existed outside the legal sector).


Id. at pg. 58.

Id. at pg. 49.

Id. at pg. 50.

Neither Norway nor Denmark had adopted effective measures to combat the demand for commercial sexual services until 2009, when Norway adopted a law banning the purchase of sexual services. At the time of this evaluation of the Swedish law, the Norwegian law had not been in place for sufficient time to significantly impact the level of prostitution or sex trafficking in the country. Currently, Denmark is also considering a law banning the purchase of sexual services.

Swedish Ministry of Justice, English summary of the Evaluation of the ban on purchase of sexual services (1999-2008), 2 July 2010. It should be noted that the report acknowledges the limitations in trying to determine the prevalence of illegal activities (such as trafficking and the purchase of sexual services), but even with these limitations, it is confident in the statements listed above.